

SDG 16+ Technical Consultation on Inclusive Institutions at the Local Level

Tunis, Tunisia

26-27 March 2019

Final Report

Name/Email address of the submitters: Tomoko Vazeer (UNDP Regional Hub for Arab States, tomoko.vazeer@undp.org), Tanya Pedersen (UNDP HQ, tanya.pedersen@undp.org), Luc Aldon (UCLG, l.aldon@uclg.org) on behalf of the co-organizers of the event.

Rationale of the Consultation and Key Trends

Rationale

The Consultation provided a space for presentations and group discussions on both national and sub-national experiences from governments at different levels and representatives of civil society. The examples selected below are relevant to all the different components in achieving SDG 16+, including planning, implementing, M&E and reporting, while the primary focus of discussion hung around inclusion of all actors to achieve SDG 16+ and the Agenda 2030 as a whole, particularly at the local level, by 2030. Key trends captured during the consultations are the following:

Key trends

1. SDG 16+ is seen as an important accelerator of the SDGs at the local level, particularly for Arab States where the roles of local institutions are increasingly recognized as central to service delivery, peace-building, sustainable and inclusive economic development and livelihoods given the insecurity, conflict and lack of trust in government (in some cases there is no functioning central government).
2. In this context, empowering local authorities and other local stakeholders such as civil society, the private sector, media, academia and citizens at large, especially youth, women and vulnerable groups, to collaboratively engage in participatory consultations and reflect on the voices and meet the needs of the citizens is recognized as key to build trust in society and create social cohesion, deliver necessary services and achieve sustainable development as a whole. Many national and local governments, including from Tunisia, Iraq, Morocco and Spain, presented good practices on civic engagement, multi-stakeholder participation and collective decision-making at the local level. However, the participation of all territorial actors, of women and youth in particular, are still limited in the region.
3. The opportunity of open government at the local level was highlighted as an approach for the actual implementation of the SDGs locally, and good examples were showcased by regional and city governments of Scotland, Portugal and Spain. While there are improvements to be made, many Arab States including Tunisia, Lebanon, and Palestine are also working on increasing transparency by opening budget information at the local level and technical innovations can serve as an accelerator.

LOCAL action on SDG 16+

Spanish Federation of Municipalities and Provinces (FEMP), UCLG Committee of Practices on Open Government

- UCLG represents the united voice of regional and local government. As a global network of Local and regional governments, it advocates that local governments can bring the 2030 Agenda to citizens and see that citizens priorities are acknowledged.
- UCLG functions as a platform for local and regional governments to exchange knowledge and strategize together and identify how to solve the pressing problems. One of the key issues, is find new ways to strengthen citizen's trust in the local public sector, not only for service provision, but for the overall rest of the governance system to work. Citizens increasingly demand more information about their government's action, as well as greater transparency and accountability, and new mechanisms of dialogue with local public administration.

- Open government (in strategic planning, policy, budgeting and political agendas) highlights new ways of public management and collaborative work between citizens and governments, which brings space for other stakeholders in decision-making, monitoring and co-creation of policies and enhance transparency.

Municipality of Medenine, Tunisia

- The Municipality formulated an overall strategy in both short-term and long-term, which takes a participatory approach including all stakeholders, e.g. international and national actors, researchers, private sector, academia and general public.
- “Local Development Plan by 2030” was created using a participatory approach and connecting different projects, which aim to improve living conditions of citizens and support social cohesion at the local level.
- Achieving the SDGs was mainstreamed at the city level, as much as at the national level. In preparation of the development strategy of Medenine municipality, 45% of the active participants were women and youth. Together they collected data and identified challenges and priorities of the city, and formulated a common vision for development, i.e. protection from floods, setting up a school of medicine and railway.
- There are 61 projects in Tunisia (14 are municipal projects) and are divided into 3 action plans for enhanced implementation, and now in the last stage of implementation to be followed up by M&E.

National Federation of Tunisian Cities, Tunisia

- In including all citizens in the government of Tunisia, the challenge on how to increase women’s inclusion and participation remains; many women do not get involved in activities due to child care (particularly in rural areas) or economic reasons. To address this situation, projects to facilitate integration of women by offering child care services and integrate economic challenges for women have been implemented.
- Unemployment and migration are particularly affecting youth.
- Often, people with special needs would be excluded from the city due to physical limitations; solutions were implemented to make them feel that they belong in the cities, e.g. repair of sidewalks and passageways, transportation, making the cities and public spaces accessible.
- In order to promote participation at the local level, Tunisian cities have developed and distributed guides and a manual explaining the city strategies (into which the SDGs are integrated) to the local communities, so that people are inspired and will partake in developing their own local programs.
- In this process, the sustainable objectives at the national level need to be presented at the local and regional levels, as well as participatory budgeting should be encouraged as a way to build trust between citizens and the local authorities.
- The cities also build capacity of local communities through networking and sharing experiences and created national coordination committees across all levels, for all programmes, in order to be in synergy with sustainable objectives present in both national and local level. To ensure continuity and synergy, a dedicated task force was created.

The Local Security Committee in Sidi Hssine and civil society, Tunisia

- The relationship between citizens and the police was challenged when such relationships broke down during the dictatorship and the subsequent revolution.
- The community policing was implemented after seeing success cases in other countries, but the project itself is Tunisian and adapted to the Tunisian culture and society.
- It is critical to have a wide selection of stakeholders and civil society representative to discuss problems and challenges, and needs to bear in mind that: composition is never fixed, so that it can be adapted to each issue, the case differs from region to region, city to city, town to town, every stakeholder has a role to play and while a large number of attendance matters, being able to find real solutions matter more.

- Ownership by the community is critical; for example, it was the citizens that protected institutions in times of vandalism and they proposed solutions to enhance safety in Tunis.
- For the democratic transition to be successful in Tunisia, the voices of citizens need to be heard without judgement and their voice, whether in person or online should not be silenced.

City of Tetouan, President of Medcities network, Morocco

- The issue of local action must be looked at keeping in mind that, firstly, there is an urgent need to increase local ownership of the SDGs at the local government and at the levels of the communities. Secondly, local policies and actions are contributing to the SDG on a daily basis, yet, there is a need to promote greater coherence between national and local policies and priorities in order to promote more equitable and sustainable territorial development, with the aim of not leaving any region or territory behind. This should be better reflected in budgetary efforts at both national and local levels.
- The SDGs, and SDG 16, particularly, are part of our daily efforts and local vision – whether local governments are aware or not. The strategic planning of Tetouan, for instance pursues a perspective of promoting political, social and economic integration and gives priority to spatial planning and the strengthening of public services: mobility and waste management, sanitation, risk prevention, heritage and environmental protection.
- Lastly, the members of Medcities recognizes the importance to have a local-based action plans and produce concrete results in terms of coexistence and culture of peace. UCLG has a peace price. The example of welcoming and integrating migrants in social, cultural and economic local ecosystems are particularly relevant.

City of Agadir, Morocco

- Elements of open governance can be implemented on four levels: civil society, transparency and monitoring, declaration of assets in public positions, rights of access to information; namely 1) 1st level: preparation of a community action plan that covers a period of 6 years, using participatory approach and promoting joint efforts of civil society and citizens, 2) 2nd level: implementation of the plan, M&E, 3) Engagement of citizens in decision-making process while ensuring transparency and enabling the citizens to be a key pillar, and 4) Control, audit and inspections to ensure integrity of the institutions and public servants, monitor declaration and open the financial information on projects to the public.

City of Chefchaouen, Morocco

- Participation of civil society has promoted right to access of information, e.g. constitutional text translated into judicial texts, and law to obtain and right to information.
- The city has 10 years of experience working with different associations, periodically hold different festivals to bring people together, provide space for social meetings to discuss opinions, and conduct training on participatory council for energy, ecology and sustainable development as well as on efficient utilization of energy aligned with the SDGs, e.g. renewable/solar energy.
- A Youth Council was established to provide a space to discuss equal opportunities for youth to benefit from the city's goods and services.
- Participatory budget was also introduced for different projects that matter to citizens, such as street lighting. In this process, civil society is involved, for instance in sanitary issues.
- Challenges include legal instruments which have to be adapted in the community context and more training to build capacity for different skills are still necessary.

City of Kenitra, Morocco

- Participatory mechanism for local decision making requires a legal framework, which is highlighted in Moroccan constitution (article 13). Political will to put the objectives into law was critical to put effective conditions into place.

- The city allocated budget for a participatory project selected from the competitive process in the community.
- The city ensures that all kinds of committees and stakeholders, including civil society together with all different parties, form direct participation of decision making.
- Consultative meetings, information sharing meetings and focus groups to prepare a work programme are held with the aim to: bring together merchants and artisans for consultation on taxation before making decisions, facilitate indirect forms of decision making including through website, social networks, Facebook page and questionnaires to evaluate these public services, and provide explanations for the decisions and actions, as well as discuss ways to improve services and indicators for measuring performance and satisfaction.
- The city created tables to follow up the implementation of the plans to track the progress, and the summaries of the consultative meetings are made public and address the needs of the citizens that participated in the meetings.
- The results of participatory decision making in programming highlight the need to disseminate the information on progress and outcomes at the each stage of implementation and recognize the citizens are entitled to obtain such information.

Province of Barcelona, Spain

- Local governments have been proactive in building together with citizens the new mechanism of local decision-making and public management. The OIDP observatory provides a worldwide selection of practices and knowledge's exchange on participatory mechanisms: on how to listen, collaborate, share and build bottom-up decision making processes.
- At the level of the Barcelona Province, there are a number of examples of good practices on Open Government at the level of the province or at municipal level. All make use of technology, and making sure that stakeholders have ownership on the process. Co-produced data must be owned by those producing it. from the Barcelona City Government: 1) Dyntra – Dynamic transparency index, Transparency International, 2) Diputació de Barcelona (DibaOberta) – aims to build open government inside institutions to ensure transparency and inclusion, and 311 municipalities are on-board to promote their own open government, 3) Gava Obert – Open Data of the municipality of Gava. These are not webpages, but a paradigm change in the relationship between citizen, civil society, private sector, any stakeholder and the government.
- Lastly, local governments, with the support of the other tiers of government and international organizations, must have at the heart of their strategy the goal to create the necessary conditions for local stakeholders to make profit of the knowledge they have of their priorities and environment.

Irbid Municipality, Jordan

- The municipality faces challenge of social cohesion in the face of Syrian refugee influx.
- To promote social cohesion at the local level, the municipality learned refugees' professional background and organized meetings between local population and refugees.
- The municipality also worked on social welfare system and complaint system through Irbid radio to increase satisfaction by citizens.
- It actively takes refugees' opinions into account when designing projects.

Municipality of Deir Nbouh, Lebanon

- The municipality has been working on increasing transparency.
- The challenge remain as continued violence and instability caused by war and influx of refugees impedes

- In order to avoid sectarian violence, the municipality has set up a web portal to raise awareness between citizens, especially youth and women, and automate all the union processes while supporting the engagement of all stakeholders.
- To promote transparency, the union budgets are published online since 2004, union meetings are broadcasted on live, and other initiatives such as Tenders online and Online calendar which informs real-time the citizens of where the union members are.
- To improve social cohesion, cooking classes between Lebanese and Syrian women are organized to exchange and understand each other better.

City of Bethlehem, Palestine

- With occupation by Israel since 1969, there are violations against the international law happening on a day to day basis in the occupied territories and hence there is a lack of stability and security.
- Different zones under non-Palestine Authority (PA) control makes it difficult for Palestine to work on the SDGs - Zone A (under control of PA), Zone B (Admin affairs controlled by PA and security by Israel) and Zone C (mostly controlled by Israel). In particular with Zone C, there is no ownership for Palestinians since permission is required by Israel to take on anything.
- 500 + settlements over years, new ones to continue to be built surrounding Bethlehem. 450,000 Palestinians living in Bethlehem but the majority of the residents are settlers. Given that Palestinians have control over only 13.1% of the Bethlem territory, development efforts in Bethlehem faces major adversities. It is hard to see hope for Palestinians in general, given 50% of the Palestinians live in 18% of the territories and basic services such as water is controlled by Israel.
- In Bethlehem where it has different quarters, elected committee are working with PA in order to identify needs and challenges of their local areas, which improved community relations and participation.
- Yet Bethlehem recognizes the importance of building peace in the communities and society; there are three refugee camps, two universities and ten or more local organizations whose mandates are to identify and meet the demands of the people.
- The municipality continues to work with all stakeholders and other municipalities, and is conducting a mobility study.

Association of Netherlands Municipalities (VNGi), UCLG Commission on Peace and City Diplomacy

- There are Libyan refugees affected by war residing in the border area of Tunisia who require support; the impact on the population of both sides of the border had to be assessed, e.g. schools were affected.
- In 2012, municipalities needed to work together in order to construct and set up peace in the border area between Tunisia and Libya through initiating dialogues between the communities and contacted other municipalities of the border to try to manage this situation with help of different organizations.
- There were many issues, such as fear, illegal activities, and contraband in these areas.
- Most important was to focus on cooperation between Libyans and Tunisians, in particular cross-border mediation, interventions between different forces and militias such as conducting training sessions, promoting information sharing, creating cultural activities to build understanding of the community among the stakeholders and promote peace.
- In order to ensure engagement of various stakeholders, 15 Tunisian villages, town charters and people of different race, gender and age were included in these activities.
- Managing increasing demand for public services, particularly in the urban areas was also critical.
- Controlling rumours was also important, such as ones about spreading diseases easily catch people's attention and drive their view in a negative way. It was critical to reassure the people, using audit and a social (physiological) survey.

- Women's participation in the elections are also encouraged and now there is constitution to defend gender parity to elect councils.
- Network of towns is being promoted.
- Gender monitoring is critical together with rule of law, in terms of women's participation in formulating strategies in the communes and municipalities and their entitlement of receiving the same services and goods as men.

Strong Cities Network

- When actions are locally driven, it is essential to be aware of the national strategies and develop means that are congruent.
- Questions to think about include: how to identify local drivers and courses in a local context for instance in VE as one street may be different from the other.
- Granulating problems is an important initial step in order to identify the right people to get involved and it needs to be carried out early on, so that they are more likely to take part if it's at the initial stage (when it's already something negative, it becomes difficult to get people involved). How people can receive good information, good people to work with and recourses to tap into are also factors to consider.
- Once problems are deeply analysed, developing a practical plan for a longer term, along with identifying proper focal points with necessary skills and actors that can influence others with a credible voice is suggested. The practical plan also needs to incorporate the local priorities.
- The relevant agreements should not be too complex, and hence they should have the balance of minimum required while functional.
- In some localities, there are already well-established institutions and finding where they intersect, e.g. education and health, would be a good entry point to have the local buy in and work collaboratively.

Municipality of Valongo, Portugal

- The municipality promotes youth participatory budgeting, with aims to build more autonomous community, connect everyone and for city to be accountable for their citizens.
- Since 2014, 12,000 young people from 6 to 35 years old participated. Kids as young as 6 years old matter as kids and youth have an impact even within the family.
- By listening to their ideas and incorporating them into project ideas, the proposals owned by them are submitted to the committee for further processes. The proposals include building parks and green areas.
- The results of these initiatives included 27 city + 15 rural area projects in 2018 – 2019. Since 2014, 2 million euros have been allocated to projects designed by youth. The unemployment rate has decreased and there is increasing interest among the public for democracy. A special committee has been established on youth and citizenship. The Mayor actively listens to the project proposals and consider them for the municipality plan. The government has created participatory budgeting for some issues, e.g. youth. Tools on how the government work, such as manuals, information which easily explain rights, duties and how to participate have been introduced.
- Evaluation of the impact of the projects is also held to increase accountability of the municipality and improve understanding among the citizens about the project outcomes and impact on youth and community.
- Courses for youth and citizens, under project called "Super Citizens" in which the work of municipality and the budget processes are explained, are held every year.
- This model of participation from young ages without excluding anyone will further the participatory

- Within the local authority, a highlight is “I matter” project, which aims to improve the quality of life of the employees of the municipality. It is built on a notion that happier employees will do better work.

NATIONAL action on SDG 16+

Presidency of the Government, Tunisia

- The Presidency of the Government is the lead of SDG 16 initiative from 2014, upon the revolution and formulation of the new constitution.
- In an effort to contextualize SDG 16, from 2015 to 2016, Tunisia identified national goals and targets, and according to their relevance and feasibility to be measured, global indicators are adapted in Tunisia context. 34 indicators were chosen by a participatory process in a technical committee.
- To initiate SDG 16 contextualization processes, the government conducted the Tunisia SDG 16 Baseline Study, composed of introduction of the objectives and methodologies of the study, analysis of the situation of the goal based on participatory assessment, and analysis of implementation to be followed up by monitoring.

National Statistics Institute, Tunisia

- Tunisia has developed relevant targets to align Tunisian interests with the SDGs.
- The country has supported participation with the enactment of Article 13, which encourages all citizens to participate in the national and local level.
- Based on the SDG16+ indicators (revised every 3 years), the country needs to conduct monitoring and have database to track progress and have necessary modifications if it goes off the track.
- At the same time, the needs of citizens and their vision and expectations(especially for the areas that are direct interests for them, such as education, security, gender, unemployment and other issues at the local level), as well as mapping of the resources required are to be captured. Especially youth involvement is crucial at both local and national level. A study on the views of families and youth has been published.
- The country also seeks to measure citizen satisfaction on public services, e.g. pavements and road.
- However, challenges still remain in involving more youth and general public as many are not yet willing to participate with little interest, and there is a gap between local governments and the citizens. Awareness – raising for participation is necessary, and sharing good practices of local government successful in this regard would be helpful.
- The country has regional disparity in different regions; the relationship between local authorities and the citizens and how they can collaborate need to be analysed and addressed.

Tunisian Institute for Democracy and Development

- Participatory democracy in Tunisia was documented from 2011 – 2016, showcasing the activities of various associations and international organizations along with local know-hows.
- Introduction of locally-tailored tools and mechanisms for consultations is essential to ensure the model is workable.
- The coastal town of Sayed was the first Open Municipality in Tunisia and considered a good example for how to promote democracy, in that it opened up the town by connecting to wifi and citizens are informed through an online network of updates from the municipality. For instance, when taxes were increased, they were notified via mobile phones.
- In an effort to have the bottom-up approach, there have been pilot initiatives in five municipalities, in which assessment of needs and required budget in respective communities was conducted. These municipalities also ensured to reach out to remote areas to have their participation in decision making. Such pilot phase approach was important to make sure that the projects truly function.

- For the participation to be meaningful, involving associations is critical; in Tunisia's case, they created an app through which municipalities and citizens can exchange ideas. The app is utilized today and it has staff to follow up with suggestions, observations and problems raised by the citizens.
- Participation should be complemented with equipping the stakeholders with necessary skills, competencies and tools, and adapted in the local context rather than adopting the US/EU models.

Ministry of Interior, Jordan

- Jordan encourages inclusion of citizens in managing local affairs, e.g. implementing decentralization reforms that consider fostering participation of citizens and civil society organizations, facilitating capacity-building of local communities to acquire necessary skills and practices, and promoting awareness-raising of rule of law and opportunities.
- The country's Decentralization law incorporated gender approach.
- The 2030 agenda was used to reformulate the policy making to address the demands of citizens and also consider gender perspectives in Jordan.

Ministry of Planning, Iraq

- Iraq experienced 40 years of war and siege. However in 2015, the country formed a central committee for Sustainable Development with eight teams, including one dedicated to work on SDG16+.
- Other committees are also formed to complement the central committee, such as Peace and Good Governance Committee, in different ministries and provinces.
- Iraq faces challenges that are also prevalent in other Arab States, including the need for better protection of Human Rights and corresponding legal frameworks, better engagement of local government and civil society, difficulties in decentralization due to weak capacity and little empowerment of local government, outdated laws, lack of stakeholder engagement and corruption.
- Strategic analysis of the Iraqi context and the principles of the Iraq strategy were conducted to identify priorities for development in Iraq. As a result, the country has elaborated a definition of 16+ and established a common vision for its achievement; including respect of human rights of all citizens, encompassing rule of law, access to justice, participation in decision making, transparency and anti-corruption.
- The country is focusing on establishing a peaceful society and has prioritized 7 SDGs to achieve this aim.
- With the VNR being prepared this year, the country promotes good governance and policies aligned with the SDGs in particular on education (provision of institutions and infrastructure), equality and gender, and economic progress and good working conditions.

Open Government, Scottish Government, UK

- Trusting government is essential and there are two main points to help the open government partnership in the case of Scotland.
- One is sharing values in terms of economies, social and politics among governments at all levels and the society as a whole, and the other is formulating a national performance framework open to the citizens, which is up to date and aligned with the SDGs to measure progress in achieving sustainable development.
- In building trust between different levels of governments, communication and collaboration with civil society and local authorities are essential, bearing in mind the core values (openness, transparency, inclusion and equality) and open progress measurement.
- Local authorities are recognized as joint deliveries of the national framework and strategy, supported by agreement with 32 local governments for shared objectives: well-being of people and sustainable economy. Through local working groups, the stakeholders discuss the plans and strategies aligned with the national performance, making the decision-making and results visible to the society.

- One concrete example of collaboration between the national and local governance is how they addressed a knife crime in Scotland, when Glasgow became “the murder capital of Europe.” The police service, local government, churches, civil society and other actors worked together to handle this issue including addressing victims of the crime. As a result, there was 81% less knife crime in Scotland.
- Since every area has different circumstances, each process of open government should be treated according to the context.

Ministry of Local Development, Egypt

- Egypt faces a number of challenges when it comes to localizing SDGs, such as inclusion of all, data collection and M&E at the local level and coordination between central and local governments. The state needs to identify the kind of institutional reform that local governorates require to implement the SDGs. So far, with an aim to achieve the 2030 Agenda, the central level of governments has introduced a law combatting corruption, as well as electronic systems through which citizens can follow the progress of the reform, and sector based plans with monitoring mechanisms to follow the SDG implementation. Parts of the central administration have likewise been restructured to work on the SDGs.
- There are programmes in four governorates that follow the reform of Egypt, which encourages participation of the local governments in planning and programming.
- The sector plans and strategies were based on discussions in sector defined working groups that included various actors in the society, and the country sees the need to define the roles of each party based on their competencies in implementing them.
- In Egypt, the villages are ones in need the most. The Government formed a Village Development committee and there is an office within the ministry which provides technical support to all levels (local communities, central government, or governorate) to address this issue. The committee brings together all parties.
- Given the development plan at Central level, a financial ceiling is applied which divides the central and other levels of governments.
- The country seeks better operationalization of M&E on development progress, but technical support for accurate reporting and funding remains as challenge.
- A system for filing complaints is considered a good initiative in making citizen’s voice heard at each governorates in Egypt.

International Observatory of Participatory Democracy

- In Barcelona, a good practice in participatory open government to showcase is the launch of open government strategy and presentation of the online tools of the Province of Barcelona. The objective is to promote participation. The platform posts different ideas and solutions by the citizens, for them to start collaborating with each other and with their local government. While the quantity (representation of the large population) is important, the city works on maintaining quality.
- The Observatory also provides a diverse set of examples of implementation and uses of participatory budget systems to empower citizens. In this mechanism, the information about the budget and the responsibilities and powers of citizens in the process are clearly explained so that it can lead to positive change in the budget accounting culture.
- Electronic voting experiences have also proven to be good practice to promote cultural change among people who are not been familiar with technology.
- Three main principles of participatory open government: 1) Transversality (all institutions believing in citizen participation and applying it as a philosophy at all levels beyond government, 2) Proactivity (identification of problems and discussion as well as application of solutions), and 3) Innovation (utilizing innovative technologies to cover the large population).

people's ideas so that they feel they are part of the decision-making). Discouraging or ignoring their ideas would bring down their expectation and participation.

- Throughout these processes, the inclusion of all citizens (elderly, the poor, those with lower skills) needs to be taken into account, with provision of access to internet and digital tools.

UNDP Libya

- In case of Libya, traditional peacebuilding initiatives were taken, i.e. National Reconciliation. Provision of basic services, employment and building social cohesion bring peace to communities, and these initiatives are linked to SDG16 in the country.
- Libya has been working on strengthening local capacity, e.g. supporting economic recovery, education and social cohesion, with a focus on enforcing local stability and community security. In addition, local economic recovery and development, including job creation and building livelihoods are supported by the local authorities.
- Social peace and local development partnership is one of the main tools used in these initiatives, to understand the different characteristics and nature of conflicts in each city and town, as these issues are very sensitive.
- Community-level partnerships with municipal councils, elders, religious leaders, influencers and the private sector facilitate inclusive dialogues and collaboration. These partnerships are built through a 6 step process, which includes “eyes/hands” on local level, i.e. assigning someone who can monitor the situation in each city constantly, and re-build trust, since local communities have lost trust in their neighbours and other groups.
- Libya sees self-sustainability as the goal and this is facilitated through training, mentoring and supporting communities. An example can be drawn from a case with a city in Libya, which contained three groups in tension and it was due to the perception of unfair treatment for a particular youth group compared to that of other youth groups, and a UNDP employee was attacked by the former. In order to address this insecurity, the elders of the attacker-group approached the other groups and discussed the issue in a peaceful manner, which resulted in diffusing the conflict within one day. Another example can be drawn from the experience of reclaiming space. Since local community in Libya reclaimed an open space that was previously occupied by ISIS, the community planted trees and flowers to make it an attractive public space. This effort contributed to a sense of normalization and public gathering.
- As part of the initiatives, UNDP has offered communities a small amount of funds to start the community engagement in local development. These grants are to be co-funded from local authorities and require community volunteering to enhance the local ownership. Such efforts include setting up a repair shops for ACs where ex-militia youth were trained to work.
- UNDP has been providing advice and help to the municipalities, since there hasn't been a tradition of working at the municipality level and linking their work to the central government. Capacity-development of the local authorities is necessary to better serve to the citizens.
- Conflict analysis and multi-stakeholder engagement are important for the country, and are conducted in 5 steps: 1) Analysis (identification of the roles of the stakeholders, security situations, history of municipalities, available resources, methodologies to carry out projects), 2) Community consultations such as holding town hall meetings (trust-building, identification of the demands and priorities of the communities, discussion on budget allocations, and community-driven decision-making), 3) Training for municipalities and citizens (how to have effective mediation, dialogues, and conflict analysis), 4) Consultative mechanism (increased social accountability by the municipalities, able to explain their activities and build capacities within), and 5) Social Peace Grants (as noted above, small grants for the community to discuss, decide and implement projects that bring peace to the community, which also enhances local service delivery.
- In Libya case, most essential is to build trust within the community as many have lost trust for their neighbours. Having community members work together for shared objectives and conducting continuous analysis of the community situation is the key.

Ministry of Local Administration and Environment, Syria

- Syria has an orientation committee divided into 17 teams, each tasked with one SDG. So far the country identified 169 objectives.
- The local councils have full independence with respect to providing services given the very painful situation in Syria and they are the channels in communicating with citizens.

Global progress on SDG 16+

General

The implementation and achievement of SDG 16+ will greatly depend on local action and leadership, in coordination with all other levels of governance. In this context, effective and targeted capacity-building for local governance actors are being useful to ensure an inclusive and participatory SDG implementation through effective multi-stakeholder participation in the definition of subnational and local development plans and related monitoring and progress reports. In this context, further strategies to strengthen local governance actors' capacities need to be tailored to local contexts and priorities.

While the 2030 Agenda offers the “what” i.e. the goals to be achieved, open government has been highlighted as the “how” to support the transformation of the objectives in local reality. Ongoing experimentations and innovation efforts are contributing to better information sharing, communication and participation. Though, extra efforts and systems need to be put in place to maximise the potential of inclusion and participation in SDG 16+. The 2030 Agenda is providing the opportunity to create a common narrative on how to achieve sustainable and inclusive development through the promotion of transparent and effective local governance, meaningful participation and social and territorial cohesion.

UCLG

Since the negotiation process leading to the SDGs, UCLG as part of the Global taskforce on local and regional governments has been contributing to raising awareness on the SDGs, promoting multi-level dialogue at national, regional and global stages and making sure that the SDGs and the 2030 Agenda is perceived as an integrated and universal rights-based agenda rather than a sectorial goal-by-goal commitment. In 2018, the first Local and regional Government Forum at the HLPF brought mayors and governors concerns to the HLPF stage emphasizing that accelerating and scaling-up the implementation of the SDGs, meant providing access to data and financing, as well as capacity building in humanitarian settings to continue localizing sustainable strategies where there are most needed, particularly climate action.

In monitoring progress at the world level, UCLG and the Global taskforce facilitate a Local and regional report on local governments action towards the SDGs. It states the crucial need to make decentralisation work to have local governments' full potential in planning public investments and maintaining the quality of public services. Therefore, it is necessary to set clearer assignment of responsibilities, more coherent collaboration between levels of government and building adequate means of implementation, which fit the capacities and competences of local governments. There are inspiring practices, but it remains a worldwide challenge and time is running low. National Voluntary Reviews must be part of a long-term strategy of systematic consultations to feed policy making. Since 2016, 102 countries have presented VNRs. The results have been encouraging, but not sufficient. In 2018, local governments were involved in the preparation of VNRs in 53% of the reporting countries (up from 43% in 2016-2017 combined). Since 2016, 39% of the LRGs surveyed by UCLG (in over 60 countries) have acknowledged their participation in national institutional coordination mechanisms. This trend has been notable in Europe (57% of surveyed LRGs) and several other regions, such as Asia-Pacific (37%), Latin America (35%) and Africa (33%).

In parallel, local and regional governments have been developing and sharing local solutions to monitor progress, based on indicators and assessment tool that are tailored to their needs and that could be aligned to national monitoring processes. They have also shaped a series of commitment promoting culture as a pillar of sustainable development, or fostering non-violence and elimination of discriminatory practices.

UCLG – Committee on Social inclusion, participatory democracy and human rights

With regards to peace, cities member of the Committee are concerned with the fact that cities and the communities living in them are targets in times of conflict, (e.g., Syrian cities), and are first respondents of nearby conflicts (e.g. host cities) and, one must highlight that cities are the scene of new conflicts related to growing inequalities, the difficulty provide everyone with the decent living conditions (access to work, housing, education and health for all), access to basic services, combating discrimination, trafficking, social marginalisation and sometimes the exclusion of entire neighbourhoods or cities on the outskirts of large cities.

The Global Agenda promoted by cities fosters the Right to the city approach, which builds on principles of collaboration between the territories and among the local stakeholders. The SDGs are a call for action towards renewed the social contract. More cities are also moving towards an agenda of human rights: worldwide, 20 cities have contributed to the forthcoming report of the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights on the protection and promotion of peace and human rights. The UCLG Committee provided 60 additional practices of what local governments are doing, in particular to build a culture of peace, non-violence (and disarmament) and inclusion from the bottom-up.

REGIONAL action on SDG16+

- UCLG serves as the united voice of regional/local government covering the Arab States, Europe and beyond, bringing local voices to collectively achieve the 2030 Agenda and enhancing open government. In partnership with UNDP, it promotes online platforms such as Localizing SDGs to exchange knowledge and collectively seek solutions to problems particularly at the local level.
- Decentralized Cooperation and territorial partnerships, as supported by UNDP through the ART initiative (based in Brussels) facilitate dialogue, exchange of knowledge, information and lessons learned between local actors to implement the SDGs locally. Considering the universality of the 2030 Agenda, this cooperation modality is more than ever relevant to foster a dialogue between territories and advance solutions that address common challenges.
- Many of these initiatives can be found on the Localizing the SDGs platform supported by UNDP, UCLG and UN Habitat (www.localizingtheSDGs.org). The platform is a pioneering knowledge sharing platform that provides tools and useful resources for local governance actors to take action in the local implementation of the SDGs.
- UNDP Regional hub for Arab States facilitates exchange of examples of SDG 16+ implementation in the region and has conducted meetings and training targeting government officials, civil societies, women and youth on SDG localization including SDG 16 in Palestine, Iraq, Somalia, Tunisia and others in 2018 – 2019.
- Arab Development Portal tracks progress of the SDGs including Goal 16 in Arab States.
- For the Arab region, low rate of participation by citizen, limited communication between different levels of governments and citizens, lack of trust for government, weak coordination to of coproduction of the shared future vision largely remain as challenge.
- For the effective measurement of SDG progress at the local level, it is important to train local actors including local authorities, civil society and academia on the SDGs, how to align with the national agenda and global/national indicators which are to be adapted in the local context.

INTERLINKAGES between SDG 16 and other Goals

Based on the cases mentioned above, some highlights are as follows:

Iraq

In establishing a peaceful society and achieving SDG 16+, the country has used seven other SDGs to accelerate this effort. Education, gender equality, decent working conditions and reinforcement of economic progress based on the SDGs are part of good governance.

Tunisia

The country contextualized SDG 16 adapting it at both to the national and local level backed up with the enact-

gender and unemployment. The country has also formulated Tunisian SDG 16+ indicators to conduct monitoring and track progress to ensure the development processes are on the right track. In their baseline study, SDG 16 was linked to other goals as an accelerator.

Libya

Due to the ongoing war and widely spread insecurity, the roles of the local institutions are critical in Libya, from peace-building among community amidst rising tensions among different groups, provision of basic services and employment and education, to ensuring economic recovery and security for people. These initiatives are linked to SDG 16 in that they require strong institutions with accountability, justice and peace.

KEY MESSAGES and RECOMMENDATIONS

- SDG16+ encourages to rethink the institutional frameworks needed at all levels of government to accelerate the implementation of Agenda 2030 adopting a territorial approach in strategic planning, budgeting and monitoring.
- Build on SDG16+ to create a shared rights-based narrative to promote transparent and effective local governance, meaningful participation and social and territorial cohesion.
- The building blocks of effective local governance include responsive and accountable local governments, strong local ownership of the development agendas and the full engagement of empowered local actors.
- To prevent discrimination and marginalization, local and regional governments, with the support of civil society, are well placed to maximize diversity and inclusion of all, women, youth, and vulnerable groups, such as migrants and forcibly displaced people.
- SDG16+ is a call for renewed trust in public institutions across levels and sectors, and between people and institutions to co-create cohesive societies and local democracy.
- A culture of peace is one of the levers of local sustainable development through the promotion of mediation and non-discriminatory policies.
- Ongoing efforts of innovation and experimentation can contribute to better information sharing, communication, participation and data collection for monitoring, reporting and continuous improvement of policies and strategies.
- To unlock the full potential of all local actors, strategies to strengthen their capacities need to be tailored to local contexts and priorities